



**COMMUNITY ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (CAMP)  
OUTREACH COMMITTEE**

**REGULAR MEETING  
Wednesday, June 22, 2022 5:00 p.m.  
Minutes**

---

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was held virtually using Zoom and called to order by Chair Allen at 5:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

Committee Members      Vice Chair Jennifer Yeamans  
Steve Stamos  
Neal Pann  
Mark Palajac  
Jill Farrell  
Steven Dunbar  
Dawn Argula  
Chair Donna Allen

Absent                      Marco Torres– excused

Staff Present              Debbie Bell, Management Analyst II  
Kathy Hughes, Administrative Assistant  
Scott Lanphier, Public Works Director  
Jeff Shafer, Assistant Public Works Director  
Tara Mazzanti, Assistant City Attorney  
Natalie Croak, WR Communications Representative  
Bob Vinn, City Engineer

Noé Noyola, MIG

**2. CITIZENS FORUM**

Staff Liaison Debbie Bell explained the public comments process for the meeting. Ms. Bell explained that the meeting was taking place using the Zoom platform and being conducted pursuant to provisions of the Brown Act and recent

Executive Orders by the Governor to facilitate teleconferencing to reduce the risk of COVID-19 transmission at public meetings. An opportunity for public comments would be provided for each agenda item. Comments were to be submitted using the Zoom Q&A feature. Comments using the Chat feature would not be accepted. Comments were limited to one per person for each agenda item. Each comment should begin with the agenda item number and were limited to no more than 500 words. She explained that if more than one comment was submitted by a single person for a single item, only the last statement would be read into the record. The public comment period for each item would end when the Chair closes the comment period, and no additional comments would be read for that item.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were no public comments for items not on the agenda, and the item was closed.

### **3. CONSENT CALENDAR**

#### **3.1 Approval of draft minutes from March 9, 2022**

ON A MOTION FROM VICE CHAIR YEAMANS, SECONDED BY COMMITTEE MEMBER PANN, CARRIED ON A 5-0 VOTE, 8-0, THE MARCH 9, 2022 MINUTES WERE APPROVED WITH ONE CHANGE.

### **4. MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION**

#### **4.1 Review Revised CAMP Rules of Procedure**

Debbie Bell told the Committee that Council recently approved a revised Rules of Procedure document, adding items that are in the City Council rules of procedure. This will provide consistency between Council meetings and advisory body meetings, making it easier for the public to know what to expect when they attend meetings. There were a few changes that Ms. Bell specifically wanted to point out to the committee. The term limits for the CAMP Outreach Committee were extended through December 2023. Council decided that there wasn't enough time to get everything accomplished within the original timeframe and extended it to enable the current members to continue to serve, should they choose, without having to reapply and be interviewed. Ms. Bell told the committee that if the extra year was too much, they have the choice to step down, but encouraged them to stay on and continue with the great work they've been doing. Ms. Bell also pointed out that the attendance policy states that all members must attend all the meetings. Members who are unable to attend must notify the staff liaison prior to their absence. Committee members may be subject to removal after two absences, and that it would be Council's decision to remove the member or keep them. Ms. Bell said that absences have never been an issue with this committee. She also pointed out that CAMP Outreach

Committee meetings will now be held in the Mendenhall room of the new Council Chambers. Meetings will be on an as needed basis, but when they are held they will always be on the fourth Wednesday of the month. She reminded the committee that we follow Rosenberg's Rules of Order. She said that at a prior meeting we had told the members that if they were absent from a meeting but watched the meeting on video prior to the next meeting, the member would be eligible to vote on the minutes. That is no longer the case. If a member is absent from a meeting, they must abstain from voting on the minutes of that meeting.

Committee member Farrell said she was surprised by the year extension of the committee. She said she has been planning to travel next year and wanted to know if attending a meeting via Zoom would be an option. Ms. Bell said that as of now, there will be no virtual attendance options, but that might change over time as we progress back to in person meetings.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none and the item was closed for public comment.

#### 4.2 **Report from CAMP Outreach Committee Members**

Ms. Bell asked the committee members to report on their outreach efforts.

Committee member Argula said that the ribbon cutting for the new Livermorium Park was great, and it's a great addition to the City's community assets. She also asked about the response to the new Asset Adventure game. Ms. Bell said she would talk about that later in the meeting.

Committee member Dunbar said he got into some discussions online with people about the new park. He said people had opinions about what they did and didn't like. He explained that part of the park was funded using park fees and he wanted to help people understand that those funds have to be used for parks. He said there was an online discussion about roads, with some people questioning why the city was spending money on a park and not the roads. He said there was a specific question about the pavement at the corner of Murietta Blvd. by Nob Hill foods. Bob Vinn, the City Engineer, explained that there have been subsidence issues at the intersection for a decade. The city has tried a number of fixes, and they have all failed. Cal Water replaced the entire water line in that area, because the city thought that was part of cause of the failure. The city still doesn't know the root of the cause and will be doing an evaluation in the coming year, hoping to program money into the Capital Improvement Plan budget for a permanent fix. Until then the Public Works Department will continue to patch the area as needed. Committee member Dunbar said that the City of Pleasanton has also had subsidence issues and have hired experts to solve their problem. He suggested coordinating with them if possible. Committee member

Dunbar said he heard the City has an open budget platform online, and he has not been able to find it anywhere. Debbie Bell said that the budget software has a tool that will allow the City to share the budget information and suggested contacting the Finance Department to find out more information.

Committee member Farrell said that she had been watching committee member Dunbar's exchanges online and was impressed with how he was able to answer all the questions. She asked where he was getting his information. He told her it was from a staff communication from 2021. She said he did a good job answering the questions and said that the more information the committee members have the better advocates they can be online.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none, and the item was closed to public comments.

#### 4.3 **Discussion Regarding Asset Management Outreach Program Updates and Next Steps, In-Person Events, Stakeholder Briefings, Asset Adventure, Council Update, and Technology.**

Debbie Bell informed the committee that she has accepted a position elsewhere and that this would be her last CAMP Outreach meeting. Because of that, she wanted to let the committee know what was going to happen over the next few months while the city tries to fill her position. She told the committee that working with them on this program has been a highlight of her career. She said there is a lot of support from the city and the Public Works staff and she assured the committee that the program will continue to move forward. She anticipated that the next few months would be slow while the new person gets up to speed.

Ms. Bell asked the committee to comment on four new fact sheets – Street Lights, Traffic Signals, Traffic Signs and Bridges. She reminded the committee that the general layout of the fact sheets were approved at a prior meeting and won't change because they need to stay consistent. She wanted the committee to review the new sheets for flaws. She said the Traffic Sign sheet would be a little different because the way the city maintains the signs is different than other assets. The signs are replaced by quadrants on a yearly basis. Each sign is replaced no matter the condition. Because of that, the city does not track consequence or risk of failure for signs.

Noe Noyola from MIG shared a draft of the traffic signal fact sheet and asked for comments. Committee member Pann said that the bar graphs for the grades and the replacement costs look visually the same and could be confusing.

Bob Vinn said that the city might want to revisit the costs for all asset classes and add a cost-of-living adjustment because development impact fees and

construction costs have gone up 10% in the last year. Ms. Bell said they are putting a 30% contingency fee, and 50% for bridges. She said she could look at the numbers and see if any adjustments are needed. She understands that costs have gone up but wants to make sure the numbers are relevant over a period of time, keeping in mind that the numbers will eventually be revised with the new information collected by field staff.

Committee member Argula noticed the date on the back of the facts sheet and asked if all the sheets would always be dated. Ms. Bell said yes, and it would be interesting to track and see how things change over time. In the future, for any given asset, we will be able to look at a 2022 fact sheet and see the condition the asset was in at that time and see if we are headed in the right direction or falling behind.

Committee member Farrell said she liked the traffic signal sheet and liked the explanation and picture of all the components. She felt that was lost on the other sheets. She said on the front of the street light sheet, there is plenty of room on under the classification section to include information on the components and it would make the transition to page two smoother. She said on the bridges sheet, we used the word elements instead of components and should consider changing it for consistency. She also said the sheet was a little confusing because it shows a grade of "A" for everything, yet it has the biggest funding gap of any asset, and it may need more explanation. She suggested describing how the city would need to build up a replacement fund for bridges. She said they are all A's now, but people might question why the city would need to spend money on an asset that isn't failing. She suggested mentioning how the city would need to build up a replacement fund for bridges, so that when they do start to fail, there will be money to repair them.

Debbie Bell explained the difference between traffic signs fact sheet and the other asset classes. She said page two is different because we don't look at the probability of failure or consequence of failure because they are regulated and the city chooses to replace them on a schedule. This is to ensure the reflectivity requirements are always up to date. She explained that the top section of page two provides information on why traffic signs are treated differently and includes pictures of staff installing signs. She said the city appropriately funds the traffic sign replacement because it's done in house so we always know what needs to be replaced.

Committee member Farrell said in order to be transparent we should address whether it would be less expensive to outsource the sign replacement. She felt that there would be a lot of questions on why it is done in house.

Committee member Stamos said it might be helpful to have a stand alone fact sheet that addresses funding for all assets from a summary point of view. Debbie Bell said they are working with the Finance department to make an infographic type of fact sheet detailing asset management budgets. Committee member Dunbar agreed that a stand alone fact sheet for budgets would be very helpful.

Committee member Palajac said the city should set aside money for dealing with bridge issues and maintenance, not just replacement. Debbie Bell said that there are specific management plans for various assets and that we need to find a way to communicate that information and organize it so it can be easily found. She said staff would be happy to share that information and will start thinking about how to make those resources available to everyone. Bob Vinn said that most of the planning is done using high level estimates and statistical analysis on what is needed over time. He said it comes down to evaluating the asset and if they are in good shape, we don't worry about it so there isn't a plan on what to do 30 years in the future. He also said the most accurate costs are the two-to-five-year costs. Ms. Bell said the Capital Improvement Project (CIP) budget is the place to find that information.

Debbie Bell said staff will take the suggestions and finalize the fact sheets. Once completed, they will be sent to the committee members and uploaded to the asset management website. Social media posts will be uploaded to the various sites, and staff will also include the information in the weekly Council updates. She reminded the committee that they will be released serially to spotlight each asset for a couple of weeks before releasing the next fact sheet. She said that progress will continue to be made on the asset management plan and once approved, will continue with additional sheets for the remaining asset classes.

Debbie Bell said staff has been doing outreach, most notably at the Downtown Street Festival on May 14 and 15. The city had a booth with posters about the various downtown projects. There were also two posters about asset management, one with the general information on one advertising the asset adventure at Carnegie Park. She said it was a very successful event, and thanked Chair Allen and committee members Torres and Argula for helping out in the booth, and for committee member Dunbar for stopping by. She said the main point of the interaction was to let residents know that we do have a focus on asset management for the city. Coming up there will be two more outreach opportunities at the Farmer's Market on July 14 and September 15. She said staff plans on following the same process. She encouraged the committee members to come to one of them and help spread the message. Staff will send out an email asking for volunteers to sign up for a one- or two-hour shift. Council member Bonanno will also be at the booth.

Ms. Bell reminded the committee about the stakeholder briefings. She said they are an opportunity for the committee members to be program ambassadors and share their knowledge with their various community groups. She encouraged the committee to continue to do these presentations, either alone or pairing up with another committee member. She also reminded them that there is a training session that was recorded on how to give the presentations and a Google document on frequently asked questions. Committee member Dunbar said he looks forward to giving more presentations.

Debbie Bell updated the committee on the new asset adventure. She explained that participants use an app and walk around Carnegie Park stopping at seven different areas. At each area, they will learn a little history on Carnegie Park as well as information on the infrastructure surrounding them. She said there haven't been many participants, but staff will continue to advertise via social media and handing out flyers at various events, including the Farmer's Market. She asked if any of the committee members have completed the adventure and what their thoughts were.

Committee member Palajac said he'd done the adventure a month ago. He thought it was interesting, and he's told his neighbors and his hiking group. He thinks it would be really great for kids and looks forward to doing it with his grandchildren.

Committee member Farrell said that she used the language staff sent out for social media and pasted it to her accounts. She said she doesn't have a lot of social media presence but that someone who does could get the word out that way.

Chair Allen said she is a co-director of a not-for-profit group called Livermore Moms. It's a group of moms that get together to support one another and she took it upon herself to do a group date at Carnegie Park. A few of the moms did the adventure and they were pleased with it and felt that it was very user friendly. She will continue to encourage others to do the adventure.

Debbie Bell told the committee members that haven't completed the adventure that while it is kid friendly, it's also interesting to adults. She asked the committee to continue to advertise it to their various groups, as it is a low key way to get people interested in the city's infrastructure.

Debbie Bell reminded the committee that Chair Allen will be giving the annual update to Council at the June 27 meeting. She will take the opportunity to discuss all the committee's accomplishments since its inception in 2020. She will highlight how the committee had to pivot the outreach due to Covid. Ms. Bell

felt it was important to highlight how the committee was able to adjust the outreach message. She encouraged the committee members to attend the meeting if possible.

Ms. Bell then updated the committee on the progress of the 311 app portal that the community can use to report maintenance or other issues to the city while they are out and about. The application will be called "Livermore Connect" and it's approximately 60% completed. She said staff is hoping to have it ready for the committee members to test sometime in August 2022. After the testing staff will make any changes that are necessary and then do a press release and social media outreach. Committee member Stamos asked if the app will have a link to report graffiti. Ms. Bell said there will be something in there to either report graffiti or a link to where to report it.

Chair Allen opened the item for public comments. There were none and the item was closed for public comments.

## **5. ADJOURNMENT**

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 6:11 P.M. TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING TO BE HELD AT A FUTURE DATE AND TIME, IN THE MENDENHALL ROOM OF THE LIVERMORE CIVIC CENTER MEETING HALL, 1016 S. LIVERMORE AVENUE, LIVERMORE CA 94550.